論文

Intangible Cultural Heritage, Spirituality and Sustainability~

towards a Holistic Understanding of Sustainability

加藤 久美

Kumi Kato

和歌山大学観光学部

Abstract：

Intangible cultural heritage（ICH）is a dynamic area of study that has important implications for a number of fields, especially for environmental sustainability, the concern of this paper. Concepts such as inter-generational transmission, valuing of diversity and emphasis on human spirituality are some of the common elements. Taking the definition of ICH in the *UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage* as a starting point, this paper develops a concept of *ICH for sustainability*, in which an ethical orientation towards the natural environment expressed in ICH relates to one of the fundamental sustainability principles. The concept is developed in three stages: first, a general discussion on ICH and sustainability; second, two illustrative case studies（traditional fisheries in Japan）; and third, implications of ICH for sustainability for today's urban communities. Underlying these discussions is an understanding that *culture* is not confined to the traditional way of life; that *spirituality* is part of ordinary everyday life; and therefore that *heritage* should maintain its vitality through inevitable environmental and social changes. These concepts are innate to the Japanese, and many of the non-west cultures, suggesting valuable contributions to be made to further conceptualization of sustainability and re-defining of sustainable *development* for today's economic activities including tourism.

Imagination is more important than knowledge. For knowledge is limited to all we now know and understand, while imagination embraces the entire world, and all there ever will be to know and understand（Albert Einstein, 1879-1955）

1.　Introduction

Intangible cultural heritage（ICH）is now a globally established concept. As in the definition of the *UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage*[2]（UNESCO, 2003, "the ICH Convention" hereafter）, ICH is a dynamic area of study that has important implications for many fields, including environmental sustainability, the concern of this paper. The definition of ICH shows a number of principles in common with sustainability, such as inter-generational transmission, human-nature mutuality, valuing of diversity and emphasis on human spirituality. Taking the UNESCO definition as a framework, not as the object of discussion, this paper advances two propositions:

first, that knowledge, ethics and the sense of connection with the natural world that is seen in human use of natural resources（natural capital）all relate to the spiritual dimension of sustainability, specifically to the concept of interconnectedness; and second, that such spirituality, defined here as "ICH for sustainability", allows a linkage between culture and nature and is mutually beneficial for the fields of ICH and sustainability. Consequently, a more holistic approach to sustainability is realized, while the sustainability mandate at the same time provides a direction for cultural maintenance and continuity. The discussion is presented in three sections: first, the concept of ICH, both in general and specifically for sustainability; second, two case studies that further conceptualize ICH for sustainability; and third, implications for today's urban contexts, both in general and specifically for tourism.

2．Intangible cultural heritage

2.1 Definitions of ICH

Intangible cultural heritage（ICH）is defined in the ICH Convention as:

> the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills - as well as the instruments, objects, artifacts and cultural spaces associated therewith - that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage（Article 2. para.1）．

Further, ICH is "transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity".

The ICH Convention was developed from the *Proclamation of Masterpiece of the Oral and Intangible Heritage*[3]（2006）, which has its origin in the *Recommendation on the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore*（1989）and the Convention concerning the *Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage*（1972）. Based on this development, the ICH Convention further categorises ICH into five domains（UNESCO, 2003, Article, 2. para 2）:

・oral traditions and expressions, including language as a vehicle of the intangible cultural heritage
・performing arts
・social practices, rituals and festive events
・knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe, and
・traditional craftsmanship[4]

The main characteristics of the ICH are that it:

・is constantly recreated by communities and groups, in response to their environment, their interaction with nature, and their history;
・provides communities and groups with a sense of identity and continuity;
・promotes respect for cultural diversity and human creativity;
・is compatible with international human rights instruments; and
・complies with the requirements of mutual respect among communities, and of sustainable development.

Three points are pertinent here: firstly, culture is defined in relation to a community's life, in terms of its representative characteristics that indicate an authentic relationship with people and their place. In contrast to its predecessor, *the Proclamation of Masterpiece of the Oral and Intangible Heritage*, it is the Representativeness of human creativity rather than its（universal）*outstanding value* that is recognized[5]. Secondly, a linkage is made between cultural practices（events and activities）and their social, historical and environmental contexts. This is reflected in the recognition of "cultural spaces" or "places in which popular and traditional activities are concentrated". Thirdly, and most importantly, the elements of the human-nature connection and various forms of its realization are recognized. This, the human perceived interconnectedness with the "more-than-human world"（Abram, 2004）represents human spirituality fundamental to the concept of *sustainability*, which is a more holistic and biocentric view than the commonly-used phrase *sustainable development*; this is discussed below.

2.2 Sustainability

Although the origin of the concept *sustainable development* dates back to the era of *Limits to Growth*（Meadows et al, 1972）, the word gained global status as an outcome of the World Commission on Environment and Development in 1984 and its subsequent report *Our Common Future, the Brundtland Report*, published in 1987, in which the most frequently quoted definition of sustainable development is stated: "…. to ensure that it meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs"（WCED, 1987）.

Although the phrase *sustainable development* has become a popular "green philosophy" today, through numerous conferences and declarations that followed（eg, UNEP, 1992; WS for Social Development, 1995, WS for Sustainable Development, 2002）, this clearly places the emphasis on the sort of development that supports and relies upon technological advancement and the implied human dominance over nature. The Report asserts that economic growth and technological advancement can be maintained:

The concept of sustainable development does imply limits - not absolute limits but limitations imposed by the present state of technology and social organization on environmental resources and by the ability of the biosphere to absorb the effects of human activities. But technology and social organization can be both managed and improved to make way for a new era of economic growth; and
We see instead the possibility for a new era of economic growth, one that must be based on policies that sustain and

expand the environmental resource base. And we believe such growth to be absolutely essential to relieve the great poverty that is deepening in much of the developing world（WCED, 1987）

Clearly, there is an assumption that technological advancement and economic growth improve human life, by way of resource management that is also improved. This, however, overlooks the fact that the natural resource, the source of humanity's physical, psychological and spiritual wellbeing, is finite, and that the concepts of"management"and "resource" are in themselves manifestations of human dominance, thus challenging what is meant by"sustainable".

As a contrast, the notions of *sustainability*（Ben-Eli, 2004, 2006）and *ecological sustainability*（Orr, 1992, 2002）accept "limits to growth" and incorporate human spirituality based on the interconnectedness principle as an important foundation. Sustainability, as oppose to sustainable development, is:

> a balanced interaction between a population and the carrying capacity of an environment such that the population develops to express its full potential without adversely and irreversibly affecting the carrying capacity of the environment upon which it depends（Ben-Eli, 2004, 2006）

The idea of sustainability is holistic in that it can link together the diverse forms of capital（natural, social, cultural）, their equilibrium and the wellbeing of the entire eco-system （Meadows, 1999）. Here, the importance of human and social capital（Putnam, 2000）can be acknowledged.

Sustainability also asserts that humility, respect, self-regulation and the conventional wisdom of humanity run counter to the greed and unlimited desire for material wealth that are often claimed to be innate[6]. It is true that basic material sufficiency is a prerequisite for the pursuit of spiritual containment, but material sufficiency cannot of itself provide spiritual containment, and so any paradigm shift must be a result of the human desire for change. It is also the case that the sense of interconnectedness leads to the gratefulness, desire for reciprocity - and sometimes guilt - that collectively regulate human activities. This is an important source of ethical foundations for the environment. So it is a vision of sustainability that embraces all these intangible qualities, rather than merely sustainable development, that provides valuable directions today. This is pertinent to the discussion of ICH and sustainability presented below.

2.3 Mutuality of sustainability and ICH: ICH for sustainability

As reflected in the aim of the ICH Convention, expressed as "safeguarding", a major challenge that ICH faces involves the continuity of cultural practices. Challenges are numerous - globalization, industrialization, urbanization and social and environmental changes. Safeguarding may be achieved by means of documentation, research, preservation, protection, promotion, transmission through formal and non-formal education, as well as by revitalizing the various aspects of heritage measures. Nowadays, technology in particular can assist documentation and promotion. Given the functionality of ICH practices, which is embedded in everyday community life and relies on various human interactions rather than on static objects, the core of the challenge is addressing the loss of interactions and perceived *interconnectedness*, with inter-personal opportunities and the sense of community（social capital）where the cultural practices take place. Here, the mutuality between sustainability and the cultural continuity is clear, which also emerged in the concept of cultural space and cultural landscape. According to ICOMOS, cultural landscape is:

> combined works of nature and humankind … that express a long and intimate relationship between peoples and their natural environment. Certain sites reflect specific techniques of land use that guarantee and sustain biological diversity. Others, associated in the minds of the communities with powerful beliefs and artistic and traditional customs, embody an exceptional spiritual relationship of people with nature. To reveal and sustain the great diversity of the interactions between humans and the their environment, to protect living traditional cultures and preserve the traces of those which have disappeared, these sites, called cultural landscapes, have been inscribed on the world heritage list（ICOMOS, 2008: 7）.

The concept of cultural landscape was introduced into the World Heritage listing, whose original Convention was proclaimed in 1992（UNESCO, 1972）. Beginning with the nomination of Galapagos in 1972, the World Heritage Convention nominates areas as having natural or cultural, and in some cases "mixed," heritage. Currently, 878 properties, in 145 state divisions, are listed as World Heritage properties[7] with 679 cultural, 174 natural and 25 mixed properties. Cultural landscape was first acknowledged with a re-nomination of natural properties in 1993: Tongariro National Park（New

Zealand）and Uluru Kata-juta National Park（Australia）were re-nominated as cultural landscape in recognition of the *spiritual significance* of those places, for the indigenous Maori and Aboriginal peoples respectively. Currently 25 sites are recognized as cultural landscapes. The merging of nature and culture is also evident in the re-definition that essentially removed the nature and culture divide from the world heritage criteria in 2005. There is a clear shift towards a more holistic approach that enables a close linkage between nature and culture, regarding heritage conservation broadly, and the vital linkage here is the intangible cultural heritage. This will be explored further below, through two examples of subsistence communities in Japan.

3. Two studies on ICH for sustainability

These studies[8] are concerned with two subsistence communities in Japan, one of shellfish divers（ama）and a former whaling community. Specifically to be explored in these studies was their interconnectedness as a spiritual dimension of sustainability, expressed as an ethical orientation towards the environment and recognized here as an *intangible cultural heritage for sustainability*.

It was considered important to understand the human-nature interaction in ordinary everyday life held by those whose entire life has evolved in total tune with the environment, and thus their spirituality exemplify the concept, intangible cultural heritage for sustainability. As a means of representation, an approach was taken to present these cultural practices creatively, in particular using sound as a symbolic representation of human-nature interactions, which relates to the cases presented in the implications.

3.1 Ama divers

Ama no isobue,（ama's sea whistle）, is the sound of women divers（ama）taking breaths in between their dives. Ama, literally 'sea women,' dive free（ie, without oxygen tanks）for abalone, various shellfish and seaweeds throughout the year. Today the traditional form of such practices is maintained in the coastal areas of Japan, Korea and China. This study was carried out in the island village of Sugashima, Toba-city, Mie prefecture, about two hours south-west of Nagoya on the central east coast of Japan. Ama dive to depths of five to twenty meters, hold their breath for up to two minutes and rest for only a few minutes between dives. They are either a shore diver（walk in from the shore）or a boat diver （carried off-shore by a boat handler）. Ama dive for various

seaweeds and shellfish, but abalone is the most prized harvest, fetching about 8000 yen a kilo. In the region, the abalone season is typically between June and August, although abalone fishing is officially allowed all year long here, except for the breeding season. Decisions to "open the sea" are made by each regional fishery union（ama division）according to, not only tide and weather, but also festivities, rituals and local beliefs, such as the period sharks are likely to be about. The number of days when the sea is opened varies according to the region but typically it is between ten and forty days. Sugashima had the least number of days. Diving time for the day is also restricted to between thirty minutes and one and a half hours, and the announcement of such details is made in the morning.

Numerous rituals, festivities and a self-regulatory system represent the ama's ethics towards the ocean resource. They express their gratitude for the blessing they receive as well as for ensuring the safety of the divers, as without due respect, the ocean would haunt them with life-threatening dangers or indeed death itself. Most importantly, however, these are measures to avoid over-exploitation（*rankaku*, literally uncontrolled harvest）. The women's sense of ethics was most prominently expressed when new diving equipment, namely face masks and wetsuits, were introduced in the early and mid 1900s respectively. Interestingly, both innovations received resistance from the ama unions, due to fears that they would lead to over-harvesting; the goggles would allow divers to see too well and take too many shells, including those smaller than the designated minimum size, because of the magnifying effect of the glass; and the wetsuits would allow longer dives as they protect divers from cold. Although they were both accepted in all regions eventually, restrictions on wetsuits were imposed, such as a "one-wetsuit-per household" rule and restrictions on season, location and time. Sugashima was the last village to introduce masks （1965）and wetsuits（1988）and has the shortest diving season of ten to twelve days. An ama explained that "with wetsuits you are of course warm but cannot feel the ocean", and another "it felt rude to go into the sea with that black thing on".

The introduction of wetsuits also coincided with rapid industrialization, when many men took up city jobs, resulting in fewer boat handlers, so leaving women to be shore divers rather than boat divers. Ironically, with wetsuits new kinds of accidents started to occur. With wetsuits, women say, an

arm may get caught under a rock ledge, as the rubbery material can get jammed on the rough rock surface. Wetsuits are deceptive, in that one feels warmer in cold temperatures, and may allow people to take more risks than they would otherwise. The women also said that, "wetsuits exhaust you without you noticing, as you have to swim, resisting buoyancy, [while] carrying three to four kilograms of weights". Moreover, current technology has added another dread. The newer plastic waist cords, which used to be made of mulberry fiber, are "harder to cut if you ever get tangled". The introduction of wetsuits also has led to an unfortunate increase in illegal fishing, by both recreational and commercial divers. This, together with increased use of technology (GPS, transport, storage) and mass harvesting, as well as pollution, are believed to be the main causes of the severe decline in abalone numbers, a resource that has been reduced to almost one tenth of its size of twenty years ago. The women have noticed gradual but clear changes in the ocean, for example, "the seaweeds are dying like plants in summer heat", or that "unusual fish and shells started to appear" as well as "more rubbish has started to get tangled in seaweeds, sea floors and shores".

The self-imposed regulations, rituals, ceremonies and festivities have not only allowed a sustainable use of natural resources but also allowed the formation of timeless connections between humans and the more-than-human world. It is ironic that a number of external forces that breach such ethics have caused a decline in these resources and the practice itself. On the morning of a festival held according to the lunar calendar, a stream of city workers and high school students headed towards the ferry terminal as they would on any normal day, while a stream of festival goers, including fishery workers, ama, the older generation and young children, walked in the opposite direction, towards the festival site, and seemed to me to be swimming against the current. The life of the fishing village, one that has been in total tune with the tides (ie the lunar calendar), has gradually become separated from the rest of the world, since the introduction of the solar calendar in 1872 as the dominant system followed by the rest of the world.

3.2 A former whaling community

Kayoi-ura or Kayoi Bay, located at the most easterly point of Omijima Island, Nagato City, Japan is a small fishing village where coastal community-based whaling has taken place from the late 1600s to the early 1900s. Today, nearly

100 years since whaling ended, a number of cultural properties dedicated to the spirit of whales are maintained and valued by the community as their cultural heritage. They include a funeral register, a tomb, mortuary tablets and Jizo [9] statue for the whales caught in the region and many relate to the *Jodo or Pure Land Buddhism* avidly practiced on this island. Related rituals and festivities are also maintained. Most significant of all, are the prayers for the spirits of whales given daily by two elderly nuns.

These nuns reside in the Hosen-an Nunnery established during the successive years of three head priests (1779-1863), now referred to as *sanshi or* the three great masters in the community. The three head priests preached the need to plead for forgiveness for the killing; out of this the nunnery was established. One of the priests, Hojo Shonin, wrote:

> Because this coastal village has little farming land, it has no choice but hunting (fish) for livelihood. Although the intention of those whose livelihood involves killing is [not] wrong, begging for forgiveness for [the] killing is necessary. It is not justifiable, however, to allow killing simply because it is for livelihood. Such judgment of right or wrong would determine whether one reaches the Pure Land ...... .if one must kill, cruel killing must be avoided as much as possible. Methods such as large net fishing, fixed net fishing and night fishing and shooting of birds must be prohibited (Nagato City, 2003).

Today, the Hosen-an nuns, both 85 years old, are well-respected by the community and affectionately referred to as "*obi-sama*" (*honourable nun*). Both nuns entered the nunnery at the age of 13, which is younger than the average age of around 15～20. It was believed to be "an honour to the family if they can afford to have one of their daughters become a nun" and not a practice to reduce the number of children, since life-time source of livelihood had to be provided for them, either in the form of rice fields, mountain cultivation or any other source of food. The newcomers would spend 6 months to a year boarding in one of the parishioner's households, helping out with daily chores in the household and at the nunnery. During this period, the girls were tested for their suitability, willingness and physical and mental strength to serve as a nun. It was firmly believed that with a daughter becoming a nun, not only the family but the entire community would prosper, since they reduce the karma associated with taking of life. This belief is main-

tained by the current community today in the form of respect for the nuns.

Today, the nuns give three services, two in the morning and one in the afternoon, each lasting for one to two hours. Numerous prayers are recited at each session, including those dedicated to Buddhism and the Jodo sect and their various holy figures, to governing figures（emperors and local lords）, and parishioners' ancestors. Most significantly, prayers are given for the spirits of whales, dolphins, fish and all land creatures that may have been killed during farming[10]. Also among those named at anniversaries, of those who have been buried at the nunnery on that day in the last 300 years, are whales and dolphins, read along with the human names. The nuns showed me the funeral books, in which all the names of those deceased are recorded in immaculate calligraphy. The list included spirits of whales, dolphins and fish, without any distinction from human names.

Devotion to prayers is fundamental in the Jodo Buddhism, and the nun's prayers have been somewhat simplified so that all villagers could understand and follow. As a total dedication is not easily achieved today, the nuns are highly respected for their devotion and the reticulate service they give to all ancestors of every villager. Their dedication extends over the last 300 years, including the 70 years of the two current nuns. The Hosen-an nuns are believed to be the last nuns in Japan who entered into the nunnery in childhood.

3.3 Discussion

The studies present the ethical orientations towards the natural environment expressed by two communities. Although both face inevitable social and cultural changes, the significance of this intangible cultural heritage is clear today. Underlying their spirituality is *gratitude, sympathy, guilt* and thus *prayers* are evoked that reflect the ironical but undeniable reality of human dependence on other lives. Prayer, it is suggested here, is an attempt to restore and compensate, albeit conceptually, for the damage created by human activities. This is a manifestation of one of the fundamental elements of sustainability, *interconnectedness*. In this, two dimensions are present: one is connectedness with the natural world, toward which self-regulation, a sense of gratitude, reciprocity and sometimes guilt is expressed; and the other is connectedness among humans, which implies a sense of community, a human connection both current and inter-

generational.

Emerging from this are three fundamental qualities of *interconnectedness* as a basis for ICH and sustainability. It is clear that even with undeniable social change, the sense of interconnectedness has been a major factor in maintaining a sustainable human-nature relationship, and thus a sustainable use of natural resources. Three qualities of interconnectedness found in ICH for sustainability are summarized below, which can be applied to other social and cultural contexts, as presented in the following section.

First is the dialogical quality of interconnectedness. Plumwood（2002）suggests that spirituality related to the environment should contain "a certain kind of communicative capacity that recognizes the elements that supports our lives" and the kind of relationship generated is dialogical and communicative（Plumwood, 2002: 229-230）. Such sense of reciprocity may be expressed in the form of offerings, which, as Booth and Harvey maintain, is "a fair exchange for what has been taken, to maintain the balance. In this way, the idea of reciprocity emerges … For everything that was taken, something had to be offered in return, and the permanent loss of something, such as in the destruction of a species, irreparably tore at the balance of the world"（Booth and Jacobs, 2001: 136）.

Second is a sensory and experiential quality. Rose on the Australian indigenous people's relationship with their land, writes that for them, a "[c]ountry is not a generalized or undifferentiated type of place … Rather, country is a living entity with a yesterday, today and tomorrow, with a consciousness and a will toward life"（Rose, 1996）. Interwoven in the country are not only biodiversity, habitat and ecosystem but also the languages, senses, emotions and timeless connections to one another. As Abram suggests, "our bodies have formed themselves in delicate reciprocity with the manifold texture, sounds and shapes of an animate earth - our eyes have evolved in subtle interaction with other eyes, as our ears are attuned by their very structure to the howling of wolves and honking of geese"（Abram, 2004: 38- 9）.

Third is a place-specific quality of interconnectedness, which also overlaps with bioregional concepts（Berg and Dasmann, 1990; Thayer, 2003）. Sensing interconnectedness with a particular place is to understand genius loci, an

authenticity of a place, and an integrity sustained over time （Norberg-Schulz in Hay, 2002: 156）. Interconnectedness achieved through on-going interaction may be expressed as notions such as care, sentiment, concern, warmth, love and sacredness. It is also a source of identity, as Plumwood states with reference to Australian indigenous culture and identity that identity is "not connected to nature as a general abstract category but to particular areas of land, just as the connection one has to close relatives is highly particularistic and involves special attachments and obligations not held to humankind in general"（Plumwood, 2002: 531）. This, Plumwood asserts, is in contrast to Western views of land and nature, in which the relationship is more incidental and instrumental, or in another word, the connection is not internalized.

These qualities of ICH for sustainability provides a guideline for considering sustainability in other social and cultural contexts, and below, community activities in the contemporary urban context is considered as an implication of this discussion. The approach taken in these activities based on the ICH for sustainability principles is applied for the enhancement of local distinctiveness and termed *creative localism*.

4. Implications: urbanisation, creative cities and sustainable tourism

Urbanisation and creative cities

The UN Global Compact Cities program has reported that, by 2010, over 50% of the world's population will be living in cities and that the urban populations are, and will be, facing increasingly complex economic, social and environmental problems[11]. The report states that urbanisation is exacerbating existing difficulties as well as creating new ones. The process of "belonging in place" today, Armstrong asserts, needs to be understood because "belonging has become a confused concept under the homogeneity of globalization"（Armstrong, 2004: 239）. Urban problems, as well as high mobility, technology use and the recent rise in security-related fear, hinder the formation of communities. A lack of community leads to weaker connection with locality, and thus to loss of local distinctiveness. A challenge to sense of place and the creation of community can be even greater for culturally diverse societies like Australia, and in fact is relevant globally, given that diversity in perspectives, approaches and values is a worldwide reality. Armstrong （2004） asserts that understanding how diverse communities make sense of their place, their *place-making process*, is critical, because "understanding people and place helps us rethink late capitalism and globalisation, and our dwelling environments and our sense of belonging", and that such understanding enables us to "come up with new ways of dwelling, more humane community of strangers in public places or dwelling places of connectedness"（Armstrong, 2004: 240）. The importance of understanding the place-making process can be further argued, on the grounds that a commitment to a place is a critical ingredient of sustainability, where social and cultural dimensions are needed to complement the environmental aspects.

As a creative approach to enhancing the distinctiveness of a place, the UNESCO *Creative Cities Network* （2004） promotes social, economic and cultural development of cities in both the developed and the developing world[12]. Cities nominated for their distinct characteristics include Edinburgh （literature）, Bologna, Seville （music）, Aswan, Santa Fe （craft and folk art）, Berlin, Buenos Aires, Montreal （design） and Popayan （gastronomy）. These nominations can be viewed as branding of a place, and may feature *intangible* （conceptual and philosophical orientation of a city - eg city of light, colour, water） or *tangible* qualities （iconic places, monuments, buildings, natural features and events）. In particular, intangible qualities identified by the community itself will enhance the city's collective identity, strengthening commitment to maintenance of the features. Involving diverse stakeholders, from corporate to grassroots levels, such identification of qualities will collectively promote *cultural diversity*, as it, at the same time, acknowledges individuality. This approach provides informative guidelines for identifying and （re）creating local distinctiveness for communities（as a form of branding）in various contexts, with clear economic implications.

At the time of writing this paper, two projects are being carried out in Brisbane, the capital city of the state of Queensland, to enhance its place-based identity through sound. *A Soundscape of Queensland* and a *Sound Garden* were designed by the author to create local places where pleasant sounds can be heard （both natural and created sounds）, where a high quality environment （free of excess noise and clean air） is a priority and also where people become more attentive to the surrounding environment and to each other - listening to the natural environment as well as

to one another, as an articulation of interconnectedness[13]. What will be created is also a learning space suitable for diverse interests, including an education in environment, visual and sound design, landscape design, architecture and sound engineering as well as having recreational and tourism implications. Visitors to these places can gain a particular sense of place, a connection with the place through active listening and a multi-sensory experience. In this sense, these projects incorporate the concepts of *installation, performance* and *art*, in which encountering, interaction and active involvement are valued. Such creative projects that enhance local distinctiveness with a firm sustainable philosophy can be termed *creative localism*, which also have implications for a sustainable tourism.

Sustainable tourism

Tourism is an important field of study today, where sustainability is acknowledged as critical to its foundation, and with the above idea of creative localism, tourism can facilitate the interfacing of localism and sustainability in a creative way. Ecotourism, for example, is an "ecologically sustainable tourism with a primary focus on experiencing natural areas that fosters environmental and cultural understanding, appreciation and conservation"（ETA, 2008）. Local sustainability is clearly a priority as with the definition given by the International Ecotourism Society, which highlights the essence of eco-tourism as "responsible travel to natural areas that conserves the environment and improves the well-being of local people" and states its principles are to:

・minimize impact
・build environmental and cultural awareness and respect
・provide positive experiences for both visitors and hosts
・provide direct financial benefits for conservation
・provide financial benefits and empowerment for local people, and
・raise sensitivity to host countries' political, environmental and social climate（TIES, 1990）.

Ecotourism is a form of *sustainable tourism*, that is that "attempts to make a low impact on the environment and local culture, while helping to generate income, employment, and the conservation of local ecosystems. It is responsible tourism that is both ecologically and culturally sensitive"（UEM, 2008）. Again, local sustainability is clearly a critical foundation, where responsibility and commitment need to be given not only by local residents but also by visitors. As or an economic activity, tourism developed with ICH for sustainability principles, can re-define a sustainable "development" today.

6．Conclusion

As has been seen, the mutuality of Intangible Cultural Heritage and environmental sustainability is clear, having its basis in one of the fundamental ethical orientation towards the natural environment, *interconnectedness* principle. Research in sustainability is necessarily inter-disciplinary, and cultural cross-fertilization is particularly desirable, especially from the West and non-West, English and non-English-speaking spheres, arts and sciences. Intangibility has been innate in traditional Japanese concepts as seen in the two examples, and implemented from the early stages of conservation management, from which a diverse range of research can originate. Underlying these concepts is an understanding that *culture* is not confined to the traditional way of life, that spirituality is part of everyday ordinary life, and therefore that *heritage* should maintain its vitality through inevitable environmental and social changes. What emerges from here is a conservation ideology strongly supported by human spirituality, implying the importance of human-nature mutuality for further understanding of sustainability. Such principles enable re-definition of today's economic activities as a sustainable development in its truest sense.

References

Abram, David. 2004. Reciprocity. In Foltz, B and Frodeman, R.（eds）*Rethinking nature: essays in environmental philosophy.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, Chapter 5, 77-92

Armstrong. Helen. 2004. Making the Unfamiliar Familiar. *Landscape Research.* V29（3）: pp. 237-260

Bandt, Ros. 2008. *Isobue.*（CD）. Melbourne: Australian Broadcasting Corporation

Bandt, Ross and Kumi Kato. 2007. *Waiting for the tide.*（radio documentary）. ABC Radio National Radio Eye（broadcasted on 21 July & 29 December, 2007, www.abc.net.au/rn/radioeye）

Ben-Eli, 2004, 2006. *Sustainability. The five core principles. A new framework.* Available at http://bfi-internal.org/SustainabilityPrinciples_MBenEli.pdf, accessed on 20 December, 2008

Berg, Peter and Raymond Dasmann. 1990. Reinhabiting California. In Andruss, V., C. Plant, J. Plant and E. Wright（eds）. *Home! A Bioregional Reader.* Philadelphia: New Society

Booth, Annie and Harvey Jacobs. 2001. Ties that bind: Native American Beliefs as a foundation for environmental consciousness. In Boylan, Michael（ed）. *Environmental ethics.* Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall

Daly, Herman and Kenneth Townsent. 1993. *Valuing the earth: econom-*

ics, ecology, ethics. Cambridge: MIT Press

ETA（Ecotourism Australia）．2008. *Homepage*. Available at: http://www.ecotourism.org.au, accessed on 25 December, 2008

Hamilton, Clive. 2002. *Growth fetish*. Sydney: Allen & Unwin

Hay, Peter. 2002. *Main Currents in Western Environmental Thought*. Sydney: University of NSW Press

ICOMOS（International Council on Monuments and Sites）．2008. *World Heritage Cultural Landscapes*. Paris: ICOMOS

Kato, Kumi. 2007a. Prayers for the whales: spirituality and ethics of a former whaling community. *International Journal of Cultural Property*, Vol. 14（3）：283-313

--------------- 2007b. Waiting for the tide, tuning in the world - ama no isobue: soundscape of abalone diving women. In Bandt, R., M. Duffy and D. MacKinnon（eds）．*Hearing Places. Sound, Place, Time, Culture*. Melbourne: Cambridge Scholars Press, Chapter 19: 214-233

Meadows, Donella. 1999. *Indicators and information systems for sustainability*. Available at http://www.iisd.org/pdf/s_ind_2.pdf, accessed on 28 December, 2008

Meadows, Donella, Dennis Meadows, Jørgen Randers and William Behrens III. 1972. *The limits to growth: a report for the Club of Rome's project on the predicament on mankind*. New York: Universe Books

Nagato City. 2003. *History of Nagato*. Nagato City

Orr, David. 2002. Four challenges of sustainability. *Conservation Biology*, 16（6），available at http://www.davidworr.com/ Accessed on 25 December, 2008

--------------- 1992. *Ecological literacy. Education and the transition to a postmodern world*. Albany: State University of New York Press

Plumwood, Val. 2002. *Environmental Culture. The Ecological Crisis of Reason*. London: Routledge

Putnam, Robert. 2000. *Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. New York: Simon and Schuster

Rose, Deborah. 1996. *Nourishing Terrains*. Canberra: Commonwealth of Australia

Thayer, Robert. 2003. *LifePlace: Bioregional Thought and Practice*. Berkeley: University of California Press

TIES（The International Ecotourism Society）．1990. *Definition of ecotourism*. Available at: http://www.ecotourism.org/webmodules/webarticlesnet/templates/eco_template.aspx?a=12&z=25, accessed on 20 Dec, 2008

UEM（Urban Environmental Management）2008. *The sustainable tourism gateway*. Available at http://www.gdrc.org/uem/eco-tour/eco-tour.html, accessed on 25 December, 2008

UNEP（United Nations Environment Programme）．1992. *Rio Declaration on Environment and Development*. Available at http://www.unep.org/Documents.Multilingual/Default.asp?DocumentID=78&ArticleID=1163, accessed on 10 January, 2009

UNESCO. 2006. *Proclamations of Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity（2001, 2003 and 2005）*. Paris: UNESCO

------------- 2005. *Culture Landscape*. Paris: UNESCO

------------- 2004. *Creative Cities Network*. Available at http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=24544&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html, accessed on 20 December, 2008

------------- 2003. *Convention fore the Safeguarding of Traditional Culture and Folklore*. Paris: UNESCO.

------------- 1989. *Recommendation on Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage*. Paris: UNESCO

------------- 1972. *Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage*. Paris: UNESCO

WCED（World Commission on Environment and Development）．1987. *Our common future*. Available at http://www.un-documents.net/wced-ocf.htm, accessed on 10 January, 2009

World Summit for Social Development. 1995. *World Summit for Social Development*. Available at: http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/wssd/, accessed on 20 December, 2008

World Summit for Sustainable Development. 2002. *Johannesburg Summit*. http://www.un.org/jsummit/html/basic_info/basicinfo.html, accessed on 20 December, 2008

1　The author acknowledges the valuable comments provided by the two reviewers.

2　The Convention is in its operational phase as of April 2006

3　90 examples of Masterpieces of the Oral and Intangible Heritage of Humanity were listed through three rounds of proclamation（2001, 2003, 2005）in two categories: forms of popular or traditional expression and cultural spaces, or "places in which popular and traditional activities are concentrated.（UNESCO, 2006, Introduction）.

4　The Hudhud chant of Ifugao, the Philippines; Traditional Long song, Mongolia, 2005; Cultural space of Yaaral and Degal, Niger, 2005; eg Sand drawing, Vanuatu, 2003; and Kihnu Cultural Space, Estonia, 2003 are their respective examples.

5　Here, "representativeness" implies that the Convention aims to protect elements of cultures that are relevant for the identity and continuity of groups and communities, not to create hierarchy among such elements or cultures.

6　*growth fetish*（Hamilton, 2002）；*growthmania*（Daly and Townsend, 1993）

7　The Convention has been ratified by 185 states parties.

8　The full detail of this study is in *International Journal of Cultural Property*, Vol. 14（2007）and *Hearing Places*（2007）respectively（Kato, 2007a, b）. Also a radio documentary and a CD（Bandt and Kato, 2007; Bandt, 2008）.

9　Bodhisattva, protector of children, mothers, travelers.

10　*keigei gunrei, koto gunrei gyorin gunrei* and *noko-chu datsumei*. The second character of *keigei*（male and female whales）is no longer in use today. *gunrei*（spirits of the group

11　Teller, David. 2003. Global Compact Cities Program: Melbourne Model - solving hard urban issues together. *Journal of Corporate Citizenship*. Available at: http://goliath.ecnext.com/coms2/gi_0199-3103702/United-Nations-Global-Compact-cities.html. In 2000, the world's urban population accounted for 47% of humanity or 2.9 billion people（UN Population Division 2002: 1）. By 2030, this number is expected to grow to 60% representing 5 billion people（UN Population Division 2002: 1）

12　Cities may apply to nominate their distinct characteristics such as literature（Edinburgh），music（Bologna, Seville），craft and folk art（Aswan, Santa Fe），design（Berlin, Buenos Aires, Montreal），gastronomy（Popayan）and Cinema/ media arts.

13　Kato, Kumi（forthcoming）. Creative localism: local distinctiveness as a foundation for sustainability